



NON-GOVERNMENT (Voting)

Tetsuzan Benny Ron
Business Commerce

Cindi Punihaole Kennedy
Citizen-At-Large

Richard Davison
Commercial Shipping

Barbara (Maka'ala) Kaaumoana
Conservation

Liz Kumabe (Vice-Chair)
Education

Phillip Fernandez
Fishing

Alex Sheftic
Hawaii'i County

John (Jack) Kittinger
Honolulu County

Sharon Pomroy
Kaua'i County

Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala
Lana'i Island

Robin Newbold
Maui County

Walter Ritte
Moloka'i Island

Trisha Kehau Watson
Native Hawaiian

Doug Cole
Ocean Recreation

Adam Pack, Ph.D. (Chair)
Research

Kimokeo Kapahulehua
Tourism

Jim Coon
Whale Watching

Gina McGuire
Youth Member (non-voting)

GOVERNMENT (Non-Voting)

Marnie Meyer
DBEDT - OP

Vacant
DBEDT Science and Technology

Vacant
DLNR - DAR

Vacant
DLNR - HIIHW NMS

Vacant
DOH

Sandra Rossetter
DOT - Harbors

Gene Brighthouse
Fagatele Bay NMS

Malia Chow
Hawaiian Islands Humpback Whale NMS

Everett Ohta
OHA-Voting

Take Tomson
NMFS - Law Enforcement

Lisa Van Atta
NMFS - PIRO

'Aulani Wilhelm
Papahānaumokuākea MNM

Eric Kingma
WESPAC-Voting

Athline M. Clark
US ACOE

Eric Roberts
US Coast Guard

Rebecca Hommon
US Navy

61st Meeting
June 7, 2011
1:00 pm to 3:00 pm

Purpose: The purpose of the meeting will be to discuss possible council comment on aquaculture-related topics. This is a follow-up to discussions that took place at the 60th meeting of the council on April 4-5, 2011.

This will be a focused meeting that will take place via conference call and internet meeting technology and begin at 1:00 pm. The meeting is expected to last approximately 2 hours.

Any persons wishing to testify on agenda items are requested to submit a written copy of their testimony to the council coordinator by 10:00 am Friday June 3, 2011.

Members of the public are also welcome to attend in person at their island-specific sanctuary office:

- Oahu Office - 6600 Kalaniana'ole Hwy. Suite 301, Honolulu, HI 96825 (808-397-2651)
- Maui Office - 726 South Kihei Road, Kihei, HI 96753 (808-879-2818)
- Kauai Office - 4370 Kukui Grove St, #206, Lihue, HI 96766 (808-246-2860)
- Hawaii Office - 73-4460 Queen Kaahumanu Hwy #112, Kailua-Kona, HI 96740 (808-327-3697)

Primary Council Members Present: Eric Kingma, John "Jack" Kittinger, Richard Davison, Barbara "Maka'ala" Kaaumoana, Cindi Punihaole Kennedy, Alex Sheftic, Trisha Kehau Watson, Malia Chow, Liz Kumabe (Vice-Chair), Doug Cole, Everett Ohta, Adam Pack (Chair), Take Tomson, Kimokeo Kapahulehua, Lisa Van Atta, Solomon Pili Kaho'ohalahala, Walter Ritte

Alternate Council Members Present: Judy Lemus, James Yamamoto, Gordon La Bedz, David Swatland

Meeting Called to Order

Roll Call taken by Liz Kumabe

The Chair discusses how the meeting will operate - don't talk over each other. Address the chair, who will recognize commenter by name. Then commenter may proceed

Approve minutes from 60th Sanctuary Advisory Council meeting

MOTION

Kimokeo Kapahulehua moves to approve previous minutes and Jack Kittinger seconds. Liz Kumabe conducts vote, unanimous vote to approve the minutes.



Discuss comments regarding NOAA draft aquaculture policy and letter regarding Kona Blue Waters Farm recommendation

Adam Pack provides summary of the draft letters. At the council's request during the 60th meeting, the Research and Conservation committees researched and revised letters drafted by Phil Fernandez, documents were sent to the council in advance for review.

- Adam Pack asks if there are questions or remarks on the draft comment for the NOAA draft aquaculture policy
- Adam asks if there are questions or remarks on the letter to Malia regarding the Kona Blue recommendation
 - Jack Kittinger suggests that rather than saying "S/V Machias", just say "the vessels that are used" so that it can be more general
 - There is discussion about the phrase "precautionary principle/approach" and the footnote that is provided.
 - Richard Davison asks how the length of 90 days for the sea trial was determined.
 - Malia notes that the 90-day language may have been adopted from the KBWF Environmental Assessment.
 - Richard Davison asks if there is capability to accommodate another person on S/V Machias; generally notes that the letter is too specific in some respects.
 - There is discussion to clarify the intent of the letter, noting that it just voices concerns and points out that there may be impacts to the environment.
 - Becky Hommon notes that the letter sets a high standard by using the term "precautionary principle," and this standard is higher than the intent that was just discussed.
 - Kehau Watson suggests that the current version is actually a middle ground of diverse opinions, and that strong wording can be retained because Malia Chow can, in her recommendation to KBWF, somehow reflect that diversity.
 - Maka,ala Ka,aumoana also remembers the 90 day period from the EA.
 - Malia Chow clarifies that public comments are currently being incorporated and agency comments can be considered, and also notes that it will be important for the Council to formulate an opinion to go on public record since this is generally an upcoming issue.
 - „Aulani Wilhelm asks, aside from this immediate issue, if there's a way to support long-term consultation (e.g., with NMFS).
 - Regarding this current draft, Malia Chow notes that she would also include that the sanctuary appreciates a consultation process. She would also have staff ground-truth some of the specific information that's in the letter (e.g., the things that Richard Davison brought up).
 - Kehau Watson notes that Malia Chow doesn't have to marry the Council's opinion and the sanctuary's policy, but Malia Chow could pass forward the Council's position.
 - Becky Hommon wants to note that the Navy would not support the letter.
 - Doug Cole points out that the NOAA policy also suggests the precautionary approach, and he wouldn't like Hawaii to be a testing ground for aquaculture.
 - Walter Ritte notes that the high standard should be applied to everyone; Gordon LaBedz agrees.



- Adam Pack states that the vote can be taken and opinions noted, and Malia Chow can reflect the statements and also incorporate the diversity when she provides her own input.
- There is discussion about the specific nature of the letter, and that it's intended to be for this project, so it shouldn't necessarily be translated elsewhere.
- Sol Kaho, ohalahala comments that in considering the National Ocean Policy, lessening the stance would not be following suit, and it would diminish alignment with larger policies.

Public Comment

Adam Pack opens public comment period by island.

- No public comment.

MOTION

Maka'ala Ka'aumoana moves to say that we're ready to vote and Kehau Watson seconds.

MOTION

- Sol Kaho, ohalahala moves to approve the letter related to the draft NOAA Aquaculture Policy, Alex Sheftic seconds.
 - Walter Ritte: aye, but notes that he was hoping for more Hawaiian aquaculture technology as a guideline for aquaculture approach in Hawaii.
 - Motion passes unanimously.

MOTION

- Adam Pack calls for motion to approve letter to Malia Chow recommending that KBWF take precautionary approach, with a change in the first line so that the letter is coming from the full council rather than the conservation and research committee.
 - Richard Davison notes that if the second paragraph details are already from the EA, then he has no problem with the letter.
 - Jack Kittinger notes that Sol's comment should be added "this is consistent with National Ocean Policy."
 - Alex Sheftic moves, Kehau Watson seconds.
 - Eric Kingma chooses to abstain because he feels it's a little prescriptive and we don't have all the information.
 - Kimokeo Kapahulehua notes that he would vote aye, if a recommendation about engaging NMFS through continued consultations can be added then included (in Malia's letter to NMFS).
 - Motion passes, 14 ayes, one abstain.



Working group updates

Malia Chow provides a broad summary of working groups

- Paul Wong gives a brief overview of what the climate change working group has been working on.
- Adam Pack gives a brief overview of how the ecosystem protections working group has been planning their process to meet. He also gives an overview of the SAC Summit he attended.
- Malia Chow provides update on the humpback whale protections working group (proposed workshop).
- Malia Chow highlights participation / volunteer hours, commitment to the long and public process, and available information on the website.
- Malia Chow notes that we will like plan to bring working group chairs face-to-face (including island representatives from Molokaʻi and Lanaʻi), July-August timeframe.
- There is discussion to clarify management recommendations, action plans, and timing for Council meetings.

New Business

- Walter Ritte notes that on Molokaʻi, the community will have difficulty in deciphering between critical habitat versus sanctuary. How can we handle the timing and make it clear that there are multiple initiatives going on in NOAA?
- Malia Chow and Lisa Van Atta give background information that they have been coordinating
- Lisa Van Atta offers to give a presentation on critical habitat for the Council.
- Adam Pack notes that the comment period will close before the next SAC meeting, and asks if the Council feels there is an appropriate avenue for them to address this (e.g., through committees).
- ʻAulani Wilhelm notes that the Council could ask for No Final Decisions regarding critical habitat in the existing Sanctuary boundaries, at least until after the management plan review.
- Lisa Van Atta notes that June 2, 2012 is a final deadline for final decision.
- ʻAulani Wilhelm asks if there are other community plans (e.g., Moʻomomi) that can be brought back / supported by this management plan review process.
- Malia Chow highlights the effort that has been undertaken to gather existing community plans.
- Adam Pack asks for Walter Ritte's input in the ecosystem protections working group, regarding traditional management approaches.
- Adam Pack asks if there needs to be committee action. It's noted that coordination at higher levels is favored, so as long as that's happening, it's enough.
- Gordon LaBedz agrees that there is just bad branding when multiple departments of NOAA simultaneously conduct public processes.
- Jack Kittinger suggests that a critical habitat presentation at the next meeting would be helpful, and then the Council could have a conversation about better coordination.



- Malia Chow asks if this presentation could happen sooner, utilizing GoToMeeting technology, since the issue is very present and there's a lot of confusion.
- Malia Chow will coordinate with Lisa Van Atta and Jeff Walters to make the meeting happen, it can be projected in all staff offices.
- Malia Chow offers a summary of upcoming trainings / workshops.
 - Climate change / Coastal marine spatial planning: 120 participants, July 31 – August 4, unfortunately coincides with the Hawaii Conservation Conference.
 - Aquaculture workshop: 40 organizations, June 21 – 23, co-hosted by University of Hawaii Aquaculture Program. Joseph Paulin gives a summary of the purpose of the workshop.
- Adam Pack closes the meeting.